

Please critique this very short story: Sam rolls out of bed. He grabs his hair gel and runs downstairs to join Dad, who is leaving for work.

Dad looks in the hall mirror. He straightens his tie and looks again. A tuft of hair is sticking up at the back of Dad's head. (It sticks up every morning.) Dad sighs. His breath fogs the glass.

Sam stands on a chair beside Dad. He squeezes gel on his hand and, stretching, smooths down Dad's hair. Dad thanks, Sam. Sam applies gel to his hair. Now both Dad and Sam have well-behaved hair.

Dad kisses Mom goodbye. He grabs his cell phone and rushes for the door. The morning train departs for the city at 8:00 a.m. sharp — with or without him!

Once Mom took us to the city by train. A band played rock music in the train station. It was a gig! Sam watched the young men playing music, gabbing to the girls, and chewing gobs of gum. Mom said that they looked like cows chewing their cud. Sam said he wanted to be a rock star when he grew up. Mom said the train station was a den of iniquity. (Now we take a cab.)

Sam waves goodbye to Dad as he leaves. The dog squeezes by and runs off. Sam shouts, but Chase keeps running. Sam chases after him. When the dog tires, Sam can catch him. Until then, what fun! See Chase run!

Your short story has a charming, slice-of-life quality that captures a brief yet vivid moment in a family's morning routine. Below are some strengths and areas for improvement.

Strengths:

1. **Concise and Engaging:** The brevity of the piece allows for a quick and engaging read. Each sentence moves the story forward.
2. **Strong Characterization:** Even in a few lines, we get a sense of Sam's youthful energy, Dad's morning routine, and Mom's personality through her witty remarks.
3. **Good Use of Repetition:** The repetition of certain phrases, like "Now both Dad and Sam have well-behaved hair," adds a sense of rhythm.

4. **Humor and Warmth:** The family interactions, especially Sam smoothing Dad's hair, create an endearing moment that resonates emotionally.
5. **Natural Dialogue and Observations:** The comment about the train station being a "den of iniquity" is amusing and character-revealing, suggesting Mom's disapproval in a humorous way.

Areas for Improvement:

1. Perspective Shift in the Train Station Paragraph:

- Most of the story is written in third-person limited from Sam's perspective, but the shift to "we" and "us" in the train station section breaks that consistency. If the story is from Sam's point of view, it should stay in third-person or clarify that Sam is narrating.
- Suggestion: Keep the narration in third person and reframe the section as a remembered experience:
"Sam remembers when Mom took them to the city by train. A band played rock music in the station. It was a gig! The young men chewed gum and chatted with girls. 'They look like cows chewing their cud,' Mom had said. Sam had wanted to be a rock star then. But now, they take a cab."

2. Clarity in Dialogue and Phrasing:

- The phrase "Dad thanks, Sam" is grammatically off. It should be "Dad thanks Sam."
- The sentence "A tuft of hair is sticking up at the back of Dad's head. (It sticks up every morning.)" could flow more smoothly. Instead of parentheses, integrate it into the sentence:
"A tuft of hair sticks up at the back of Dad's head—just like every morning."

3. Sentence Fragment in the Last Paragraph:

- "See Chase run!" is playful, but it feels abrupt compared to the rest of the story. If this is intentional (perhaps mimicking a children's reader style), it works, but if not, it might be better integrated:
"Sam shouts, but Chase keeps running. When the dog tires, Sam will catch him. Until then, it's fun to watch Chase run!"

4. Ending Feels Slightly Disconnected:

- The story shifts from the intimate morning routine to a sudden chase scene. While it adds action, the connection between the two moments could be strengthened.
- One way to do this is to tie it back to the theme of morning rituals. Perhaps Sam always chases Chase in the morning, just like Dad's hair always sticks up.

Suggested Revision for a Smoother Flow:

"Sam rolls out of bed. He grabs his hair gel and runs downstairs to join Dad, who is leaving for work.

Dad straightens his tie in the hallway mirror. A tuft of hair sticks up at the back of his head—just like every morning. He sighs, his breath fogging the glass.

"Here, Dad." Sam climbs onto a chair, squeezes gel onto his palm, and smooths down Dad's hair. Dad smiles and thanks him. Sam applies gel to his own hair. Now they both have well-behaved hair.

Dad kisses Mom goodbye, grabs his cell phone, and rushes for the door. The morning train leaves at 8:00 a.m. sharp—with or without him!

Sam remembers the time Mom took them to the city by train. A rock band played in the station— a real gig! The young musicians chewed gum and flirted with girls. 'They look like cows chewing cud,' Mom had said. Sam had wanted to be a rock star then. But now, Mom says the train station is a den of iniquity. So they take a cab.

As Dad steps outside, Sam waves goodbye. Chase, the dog, squeezes past and bolts down the street. Sam shouts, but Chase keeps running. Sam chases after him, laughing. When the dog tires, he'll catch him. Until then, what fun! The morning race begins!"

This revision enhances clarity, maintains a consistent perspective, and smooths transitions while keeping the charm of the original. Would you like me to adjust anything further?

Thats good. I re-wrote it changing much more.

Please critique the new story. >>Yesterday, Chase stole Dad's car key and raced around the house with it. By the time Sam caught him, Dad had missed his morning train.

"You better train that puppy, Sam. I will sell him to a farm," Dad threatened.

Mom said Dad wasn't serious about selling Chase, but Sam was taking no chances. He had a plan.

When the morning alarm rang, Sam sprang from his bed, opened the door, let the dog inside, and closed the door again. Now Chase was safe inside his bedroom and Sam would keep him there until Dad was gone.

Chase ran madly around in circles. He tried to climb on top of Sam's bed, but tumbled over. He barked sharply and clawed at the bedroom door. Now Sam worried about scratches. Just as he bent down to examine the door, someone on the other side rapped loudly. Sam jumped. Chase barked.

"Sam. I brought some dog bones for Chase," said Mom, rattling the door knob.

"Great idea," answered Sam. He opened the door just a crack, but the puppy squeezed through. Chase half ran, half rolled down the stairs with Sam in hot pursuit. The puppy ran straight to Dad, who was fixing his hair in front of the hall mirror. Chase jumped up and grabbed the hair gel from the chair. Gel squeezed out of the tube and onto the hall carpet.

"Chase, sit!" Sam held out a dog bone. Chase dropped the gel and sat down.

"Good boy!" Sam gave the dog a bone. He quickly grabbed the hair gel and placed it out of reach on the hall bureau beside Dad's cell phone.

"Did you see him sit, Dad?"

"It's a good start, Sam." Dad kissed Mom goodbye. He grabbed his cell phone and hurried to the door. As soon as it opened, Chase dropped the bone and ran through!

"Whoa," Dad smiled. "More work to do, Sam."

"Quick, Sam. You'll miss the bus," said Mom.

Sam pulled a jacket over his pajamas and ran outside just in time to see Chase squeeze under the hedge.

"Oh no," moaned Sam. "Not Mrs. Cobby's yard. If he digs another hole in her garden, Sam will have to fix it!"

Sam chased the puppy around Mrs. Cobby's house three times, wondering when the pup would tire. Suddenly Mrs. Cobby's cat appeared in the front yard. Chase stopped. He wagged his tail, but the cat arched her back. Sam seized the moment (and the puppy)! Sam started back home with Chase held tightly in his arms. Amber, and her friends stood gabbing at the bus stop. The girls smiled at the puppy. Sam remembered he was still in his pajamas. He blushed. His glasses fogged.

Sam hurried inside his house. Chase squirmed out of his arms and darted under the hall table.

"Better hurry Sam," said Mom. "The bus is coming."

Sam ran upstairs to dress. If he missed the bus, he would have to ride his bike to school like a madman.

"Oh well," thought Sam. "I wanted a puppy, and Chase is worth a little chaos."

Your revised story is much more dynamic and engaging, with strong characterization, humor, and a clear narrative arc. Here's a breakdown of its strengths and areas for improvement.

Strengths:

1. Engaging Opening:

- The first sentence immediately pulls the reader in with action and intrigue. Chase stealing the car key sets up the central conflict of the story in a way that is both humorous and believable.
- Dad's threat about selling Chase adds tension, making the reader want to know how Sam will handle the situation.

2. Clear Character Motivations:

- Sam's determination to keep Chase out of trouble is evident throughout the story, and we see his problem-solving attempts (like locking Chase in the room) backfire in amusing ways.
- Dad's mix of exasperation and good humor makes him a relatable parent.
- Mom's calm, slightly amused presence balances the chaos.

3. Well-Paced Action & Humor:

- The sequence of Chase escaping, running downstairs, grabbing the hair gel, and ultimately escaping again keeps the reader engaged.
- The description of Chase "half running, half rolling" down the stairs and "more work to do, Sam" from Dad add humor without feeling forced.

4. Strong Ending with a Satisfying Resolution:

- The final moment of Sam realizing Chase is "worth a little chaos" ties the story together neatly. It gives the reader a sense of growth—Sam understands that puppies come with challenges, but he still loves his dog.
 - The moment at the bus stop (where Sam realizes he's in his pajamas) adds a final comedic twist and a relatable moment of embarrassment.
-

Areas for Improvement:

1. Tighten Some Sentences for Greater Impact:

- Example: *"Now Chase was safe inside his bedroom and Sam would keep him there until Dad was gone."*
→ Suggested: *"Now Chase was safely locked in, and Sam would keep him there until Dad was gone."*
(Avoid redundancy of "inside his bedroom" when we already know where they are.)
- Example: *"Sam chased the puppy around Mrs. Cobley's house three times, wondering when the pup would tire."*
→ Suggested: *"Three times around Mrs. Cobley's house—when would Chase*

tire?"

(More direct and keeps the pacing fast.)

2. Smoother Transitions Between Scenes:

- The switch from the morning routine to the outdoor chase is mostly smooth, but one small issue is the jump from:
"Quick, Sam. You'll miss the bus," said Mom.
→ "Sam pulled a jacket over his pajamas and ran outside just in time to see Chase squeeze under the hedge."
 - *Suggestion:*
 - "Sam grabbed his jacket, but before he could even zip it up, Chase was gone—under the hedge and straight into trouble!"
 - This would add a little more urgency and transition smoothly.

3. Clarify Some Minor Details:

- "Amber, and her friends stood gabbing at the bus stop."
→ "Amber and her friends stood gabbing at the bus stop."
(The comma is unnecessary.)
- "Sam started back home with Chase held tightly in his arms."
→ "Sam held Chase tightly and hurried home."
(More direct and natural.)

4. Consider Expanding the Emotional Payoff at the End:

- Right now, the ending works well, but adding one or two extra words could make Sam's realization more heartfelt.
 - "Oh well," thought Sam. "I wanted a puppy, and Chase is worth a little chaos."
→ "Oh well," thought Sam with a grin. "I wanted a puppy—looks like I got a whirlwind instead. But Chase is worth it."
- This keeps the humor while emphasizing Sam's acceptance of the chaos.

Final Thoughts:

Your revision is excellent—stronger characters, tighter pacing, and a natural humor that feels earned rather than forced. With just a few tweaks to transitions, sentence clarity, and the final emotional note, it could be even more polished. Would you like a fully revised version incorporating these suggestions? 😊

Those are great suggestions. Thank you.

You're very welcome! I'm glad you found the suggestions helpful. You have a great knack for storytelling—your revision really brought the scene to life with humor, action, and heart. If you ever want me to review another piece or help fine-tune something, just let me know. Keep up the great writing! 😊📖